

Ex-post Evaluation

Project PD 49/98 Rev.1 (F)

**Participatory Tropical Forest
Development by Women in Indigenous Communities
(Ghana)**

Juan E. Sève, Astrid Bergqvist and Marc J. Dourojeanni

39RFM-10
23 October 2006

Table of contents

Acronyms used

Part I: Executive summary

Part II: Evaluation report

1. Project context

- 1.1 Project background
- 1.2 The ITTO project
- 1.3 Geographic and socio-economic context of the project
- 1.4 Strategy

2. Evaluation scope, focus and methodology

3. Evaluation results

- 3.1 Evaluation of original project document
 - 3.1.1 Basic proposal
 - 3.1.2 Structure and presentation of proposal
- 3.2 Project execution
 - 3.2.1 Efficiency and effectiveness
 - 3.2.2 Techniques applied
 - 3.2.3 Project management, financial management, administration
 - 3.2.4 External factors – unexpected problems or circumstances
- 3.3 Evaluation of project results
 - 3.3.1 Anticipated results
 - 3.3.2 Unanticipated or unexpected results
 - 3.3.3 Evaluation in terms of ecological and economic sustainability
 - 3.3.4 General achievements and expected future results
 - 3.3.5 Beneficiaries and evaluation of project and non-project effects on communities
 - 3.3.6 Technical and scientific quality of results and their dissemination
 - 3.3.7 Present community and authority participation in project activities
 - 3.3.8 Post project Sstuation

4. Relationship to ITTO/ITTA goals and objectives

Part III. Conclusions and recommendations

1. Lessons learned

2. Conclusions

3. Recommendations

- 1. Recommendations concerning a follow-up phase
- 2. Recommendations for the implementing organization
- 3. Recommendations for ITTO

Attachments

Attachment 1. Schedule for the Worobong evaluation mission

Acronyms used

| | |
|------|---|
| CFCs | Community Forestry Committees |
| DWM | 31 st December Women's Movement (a Ghanaian NGO) |
| FC | Forestry Commission |
| FD | Forestry Department |
| GDP | Gross domestic product |
| GOG | Government of Ghana |
| ITTA | International Tropical Timber Agreement |
| ITTO | International Tropical Timber Organization |
| NGO | Non-governmental organization |
| NTFP | Non-timber forest products |
| PIC | Project Implementation Committee |
| PSC | Project Steering Committee |
| SFM | Sustainable forest management |

Part I: Executive summary

Background

The background to the project is given by the forest resource situation of Ghana and the work of the “31st December Women’s Movement” (DWM) in promoting the involvement of women in the forestry sector.

The forest resources of Ghana provide significant benefits to the nation. The forestry sector accounts for over 6 % of GDP and employs over one million people. Due mainly to population increase, excessive logging, bush fires, and agricultural expansion, the forest resources are under pressure adversely affecting local people. In addition, timber for the processing industry is becoming limited and plantations have therefore become a necessity.

The DWM had in the early 1990s, together with the Forestry Department (FD), sought sponsorship from the ITTO. In October 1992 a workshop was held on the theme “Women and Forest: A look at the African Experience.” This meeting provided an opportunity for an exchange of experiences among women involved in the sustainable use of tropical forests in ITTO member countries. The meeting recommended specific programs to provide women with training and logistics for the sustainable management of forests. As a result, DWM submitted a project proposal to ITTO. The project “Women and Tropical Forest Development Program” was implemented from 1995 to 1999. The results from this project motivated DWM to propose a follow-on project on plantation establishment seeking to involve local communities in the sustainable management of tropical forests.

Geographic and socio-economic context of the project

The project was carried out in the Worobong South Forest Reserve, which had been highly degraded by various activities. The Forestry Department and the communities had agreed to release 1,200 ha of the Reserve to the DWM to undertake a reforestation project.

The Forest Reserve is situated within the moist semi-deciduous zone, which zone between latitude 4° 3’ and latitude 8 ° in the southern part of Ghana. The mean annual rainfall ranges between 1,250 and 1,500 mm. The soils are of the ochrosol type.

The inhabitants in the area are mostly migrant settler farmers, and their farming activities were mainly restricted to subsistence agriculture.

Project strategy

A main reason for project selection was the commitment of the Government to increase the country’s tree cover by 10 % of the present forest estate over a period of 10 years. A nationwide reforestation target of 200,000 ha has been proposed through annual planting of 10,000 ha over a 20-year period. Considering that land under traditional authorities constitutes roughly 84% of the country’s land area, community participation is essential to the national reforestation strategy. Building upon previous experience and looking at present opportunities, the project strategy focuses on a participatory approach to forest management. From a technical standpoint, the project strategy relies to a significant extent on agroforestry techniques.

The project implementation was placed in the hands of the DWM in collaboration with the FD. A major building block of the project strategy is the emphasis on the role of women in all project aspects.

The evaluation mission

The mission took place in Ghana from August 7 through August 13, 2006. An introductory meeting took place in Accra on Monday August 7. The team traveled to Koforidua, Begoro and Worobong on August 8, held meetings and conducted field visits in the project area on August 8, 9 and 10, returned to Accra on August 10 and on August 11 held a detailed debriefing with the Forestry Commission and DWM. Also on August 11 the team had the opportunity to visit the headquarters of DWM. Saturday August 12 was dedicated to additional consultations and report writing and on Sunday August 13 the team traveled overland to Lomé, Togo for another ITTO ex post evaluation assignment.

Lessons learned

1. Communities are not the problem in community-based forest management projects. In this as in other projects, the communities are eager to participate and keep their enthusiasm even when participation implies sacrifices or when the project fails to produce the projected incomes.
2. Funding for maintenance of plantations in the post project period is essential. Among funding possibilities, sequential production systems may be the best.
3. It is not advisable to propose community-based forest plantations to restore highly degraded areas. The results will be below the economic potential acceptable to farmers, and this is an unfair burden for the beneficiaries. Natural forest regeneration may be a better option.
4. When a project is aiming at a long term for-profit venture, such as forest plantations, it is essential to carry out a serious cost-benefit analysis of the investment during the design stage.
5. This project once again confirms that site-species compatibility, among other high quality technical inputs, is fundamental for quality plantations.
6. The selection of an NGO as executing agency is a delicate matter and must follow a rigorous process. NGOs, when properly selected can perform effectively in project management.
7. Issues regarding the distribution of benefits must be settled very early in project execution or even better at the project design stage.
8. Normally, ITTO funding should be related to timber (production) and forest conservation, and avoid funding livelihood schemes that bear no relation to these purposes, like cassava in this particular case.
9. If a problem is detected with the design of the project, a mid-course correction or redesign is much better than pursuing activities that are bound to fail.

Conclusions

1. The project has not succeeded in achieving its development objective of providing sustainable income for women in the communities. Livelihood activities, established late in the project period are a bare minimum.
2. However, considering the good condition of a significant portion of the plantation forest, and the high level of participation of the local population, this is a project that still offers good possibilities of success if urgent measures are taken for follow up.
3. The project design revealed many important deficiencies of form and substance that had a negative impact on the project execution and the achievement of objectives.

4. Even after reducing significantly the plantation target area, this is an accelerated plantation program leading to a forest with an unbalanced age class structure. Additionally, there is no time to recover from mistakes or make adjustments.
5. Teak plantations have failed by and large. In contrast, *Cedrela*, *Terminalia*, *Ceiba* and *Senna* are showing performance ranging between good and very good, even with poor or no maintenance.
6. The area planted is smaller than originally proposed, resulting in smaller but better plantations.
7. Women's participation in this project is obviously more direct and effective than in other projects, but most field activities were carried out by men.
8. There is no management plan encompassing the plantation effort. This is a weakness in a major Forest Reserve and the reviewed operation has been established without the guidance of a long-term perspective.
9. Logging is still being conducted in the remaining old growth forest part of the Reserve. Reduced impact logging is claimed, but not confirmed, and logging activities do not respond to the Reserve's management plan which has been outdated for years.
10. Large tracts in the Reserve are being cultivated by landlords or private entrepreneurs without control.
11. Distribution of expected benefits is planned on the basis of a standard scheme considered for establishment through legislation. This may not be acceptable to communities. A better approach would be through contractual arrangements between legally registered community associations and government authorities.
12. A reforestation effort with 1,200 ha originally planned was flawed from the project design stage; this was opportunely modified with a less ambitious plantation program (700 ha) combined with livelihood activities (i.e., cassava processing and snail production).
13. The beneficiary population continues to be highly favorable to the project.
14. There has been a significant and effective collaboration between the implementing NGO, (DWM) and the Forestry Commission at the local, regional, and national levels.
15. The project has produced a few simple printed technical materials for dissemination. Given the wealth of lessons of experience, dissemination of results should be strongly emphasized in a follow-on phase.

Recommendations

1. Recommendations concerning a follow-up phase

- Support a follow-on phase with ITTO funding if requested. This should be a consolidation phase to solve pending issues and build on good results.
- Prepare a complete management plan for the Worobong South Forest Reserve and discontinue logging in the remaining natural forests.
- Take stock of the forest plantation experience in Worobong and surrounding areas to identify factors of success and failure.

2. Recommendations for the implementing organization

- If a follow-on phase is intended to be ITTO-funded, make efforts to obtain funds from other sources for agricultural inputs.
- On the benefit sharing standards currently under study, avoid legislation on a rigid scheme and leave room for fair compensation under contractual arrangements.

3. Recommendations for ITTO

- ITTO must avoid internal contradictions in projects with irrational commercial logging concessions taking place in the same area where local people are putting in major efforts to restore the forest.
- Given that the project's implementation took substantially more time than originally planned, it is suggested that ITTO consider, longer implementation periods, i.e., of 5 or more years.
- If a follow-on phase is requested, it is recommended that ITTO proceed with a prompt approval in order to take advantage of the successes to date and the good disposition of the beneficiaries.

Part II: Evaluation report

1. Project context

1.1 Project background

The background of the project is given by the forest resource situation of Ghana and the involvement of the Ghanaian NGO the "31st December Women's Movement" (DWM) in activities promoting an active involvement of women in the forestry sector.

The forest resources of Ghana provide significant direct and indirect benefits to the country. The forestry sector accounts for over 6 % of GDP and employs over one million people. Due to a number of factors, such as population increase, excessive logging, bush fires, and especially expansion of agriculture, the forest resources are under heavy pressure. Local rural people are adversely affected by these factors. In addition, timber for the processing industry is gradually becoming limited and the establishment of plantations has therefore become a necessity to support the timber industry of Ghana.

The DWM had in the early 1990s, together with the Forestry Department (FD),¹ sought sponsorship from the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO). In October 1992 a five-day workshop, PD 19/91 Rev. (F), was held under the theme "Women and Forest: A look at the African Experience." This meeting provided an opportunity for consultation and exchange of views and experiences among women involved in the sustainable development of tropical forests in ITTO member countries. Among the recommendations was the need for specific programs at country and regional levels to provide women with training and logistics to facilitate sustainable management of forests. As a result of this recommendation, the DWM submitted a project proposal to ITTO for sponsorship. The project "Women and Tropical Forest Development Program" (PD 27/94 Rev.2 (F) was implemented from 1995 to 1999. The results and lessons learned from this project motivated the DWM to propose a follow-on project on plantation establishment seeking to involve local communities in the rehabilitation and sustainable management of tropical forest resources.

¹ The Forestry Department was later replaced by the Forestry Commission (FC).

1.2 The ITTO project

The project PD 49/98 Rev 1(F) had its point of departure in the lessons learned from the previous project PD 27/94 Rev. 2 (F) “Women and Tropical Forest Development Program.” The aim of this project, executed by the DWM, was to establish three central nurseries in the three ecological zones of Ghana, namely the coastal savanna, the high forests, and the Guinea savanna. One of the major problems identified was the poor patronage in terms of marketing of the seedlings produced. Thus, it was realized that the nurseries established had to be supported by a plantation program to be able to realize the full benefits of the project. With this background in mind and in pursuance of the objectives of sustainable management of the forests of Ghana for production and environmental protection for the benefits of all segments of society, the DWM sought support for a new project. This new project was intended to involve local communities in rehabilitating and managing the forests on a sustainable basis to provide livelihood for local communities, and to alleviate poverty and enhance the socio-economic wellbeing of the communities. Nine communities around the Worobong South Forest Reserve would be supported to rehabilitate degraded portions of the Forest Reserve. The population in these communities was composed mainly of migrant settlers from a nearby region.

The Government of Ghana supported the DWM request to obtain ITTO funding for the implementation of Project PD 49/98 Rev.1 (F) “Participatory Tropical Forest Development by Women in Indigenous Communities (Ghana)”, which was approved by ITTC at its XXV session, to be implemented by DWM over a three year period, with a budget of US\$833,334, of which ITTO was to provide US\$589,534, and the DWM would contribute the remaining \$243,800 in kind.

The project agreement was signed on March 15th 2000, and operations started on September 19th 2000, with September 18th 2003 as the intended completion date. Two extensions without additional funds were granted, the first one until August 2004, and the second one until December 2004.

The intent of the project is expressed in its development objective as: “*To support community-based tropical reforestation of degraded forest lands which will help to improve the living standards of the rural women.*”

The specific objectives of the project were:

1. *To support the strengthening of community organizations and local institutions to achieve sustainable management of their forests; and*
2. *To support the implementation of community plantation programmes in degraded areas.*

In brief, the project attempted to reforest an important part of the Worobong South Forest Reserve through the effort of local communities with special emphasis on women’s roles.

1.3 Geographic and socio-economic context of the project

The project was designed to be carried out in the Worobong South Forest Reserve (11,000 ha), which had been degraded to a large extent by bush fires and various activities incompatible with sustainable forest management, in addition to legal and illegal logging. The Forestry Department and the communities had agreed, prior to project startup, to release 1,200 ha of the reserve to the DWM to undertake a reforestation project.

The Forest Reserve is situated within the moist semi-deciduous zone. The zone lies between latitude 4° 3’ and latitude 8 ° in the southern part of Ghana. The mean annual rainfall ranges between 1,250 and 1,500 mm. The soils are of the ochrosol type. This soil type was considered ideal for teak cultivation.² Cocoa and other crops were mentioned as those cultivated all over the moist semi-deciduous forest.

² While ochrosols in good condition may be suitable for teak, soils in the project area show several degrees of degradation, and the teak plantations observed by the evaluation team were on the whole unsatisfactory.

The inhabitants in the area were mainly migrant settler farmers, originally from another part of Ghana and their farming activities were mainly restricted to subsistence agriculture. Communities within the area were to include the following: Mianya, Feyiase, Ayigbe Town, Matahcoko and Ankasi. Later on some more communities were incorporated into the project.

1.4 Strategy

The project strategy as described in the project document covers a number of items including reasons for selection; previous lessons; and technical scientific, economic, environmental, social and managerial aspects.

A main reason for project selection was the commitment of the Government to increase the country's tree cover by 10 % of the present forest estate over a period of 10 years. More specifically, a nationwide reforestation target of 200,000 ha has been proposed through annual planting of 10,000 ha over a 20-year period. Considering that land under traditional authorities ("stool lands") constitutes roughly 84% of the country's land area, community participation is an essential part of the national reforestation strategy. Building upon lessons from past experiences and looking at present opportunities, the project strategy focuses on a participatory approach to forest management.

From a technical standpoint, the project strategy relies to a significant extent on agroforestry techniques (including *taungya*) apparently supported by forestry research results on indigenous and exotic tree species, and on the FD's experience in nursery management and plantation establishment.

From an economic standpoint, the project emphasizes the application of plantation profits to further plantation establishment through the creation of a forestry fund³. This long-term perspective is expected to make a major contribution to the overall environmental condition of the forest reserve and surrounding areas.

The strategy places project implementation in the hands of the DWM in collaboration with the FD. This is an effective combination of the FD's technical and institutional strengths with DWM's capabilities in social engineering and its extensive network.⁴ A major building block of the project strategy is the emphasis on the role of women in all project aspects, particularly technical and managerial through training in all necessary skills.

2. Evaluation scope, focus and methodology

The primary purpose of the evaluation was to provide a concise diagnosis of the project so as to point out the successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reason for successes and shortcomings, and the contribution of the project towards ITTO's Objective 2000 and the ITTO Yokohama Action Plan, as well as to draw lessons that can be used to improve similar projects in the future. The evaluation team was tasked to analyze and assess the following items:

1. The overall role and contribution of the project in the light of sector policies, development programs, priorities and requirements to achieve community participation in sustainable forest management (SFM);
2. The current status of community participation in sustainable forest management within the project's area of influence, the effectiveness of the project's implementation and its effectiveness in promoting forest conservation and sustainable management practices.

³ The forestry fund was not established.

⁴ The project document states that the DWM has a membership of over 2 million throughout the country. The movement operates at Unit, District, Regional and National levels, It enjoys cooperation with State agencies and private organizations,

3. The effectiveness of dissemination of project results and the overall post-project situation in the project's area of influence;
4. The unexpected effects and impacts either harmful or beneficial and the reason for their occurrence;
5. The cost efficiency in the implementation of the project, including the technical, financial and managerial aspects;
6. Follow up actions in order to enhance uptake of project results, and the project's relative success or failure, including a summary of key lessons learned, and the identification of any issues or problems that should be taken into account in the designing and implementing similar projects in the future.

The evaluation team was also required to analyze and assess the contribution of the specific studies in various forestry-related disciplines prepared by the project regarding the achievement of sustainable forest management in the project's area of influence and the results and potential impact of applied research conducted by the project (if any) and its contribution to the overall knowledge on community participation in SFM in the region.

The evaluation consisted of a desk review of relevant documents related to the project's design and implementation, including its final report, prior to country level visits which included meetings with authorities as well as field surveys and contacts with beneficiary populations. Initially, a review meeting was held with national and local forestry sector authorities, resource persons, people formerly associated with the project, and other stakeholders, which gave the evaluation team an overview of the situation in the project area.

A field visit of three days was then undertaken in the project area to review the project's achievements and to meet with representatives of government agencies and other cooperating partners, and representatives of local communities and other stakeholders. The focus was on the ex-post situation and the more long term effects of the achievements, including their ecological and economic sustainability.

After the field visits a presentation of findings, lessons learned, conclusions and initial recommendations was delivered to representatives of the host country.

3. Evaluation results

3.1. Evaluation of original project document

This section addresses, in the first place, a number of issues dealing with proposal content, and secondly, structural aspects that could have been handled in a different way.

3.1.1. Basic proposal

The basic project proposal was designed in accordance with ITTO requirements for project design. Although not very detailed, it seemed to encompass the necessary elements for a project document as approved by the ITTO governing bodies and the Council of the ITTA in 1994. However, a number of issues arise in terms of proposal content:

- The land tenure situation brings up an important issue regarding proposal content. As will be discussed in later sections, while the project document states that "an agreement between all the interest groups has been worked out, in terms of sharing of the benefits", the rights and obligations of the parties do not appear to have been established, either in terms of land use rights, or in the sharing of the project benefits. This situation can lead to conflicts between the populations and the Forestry Commission and have a negative impact on consolidating project results and eventual follow-on activities.

- As already mentioned, the project document claims that the soils are “very ideal for teak cultivation.” As will be discussed later, the evaluation team found that teak plantations performed by the project had been on the whole unsuccessful largely owing to poor soil suitability for this particular species. The project design would clearly have benefited from a thorough soil survey at the planning stage, rather than relying on a generalization based on the suitability of the major soil type existing in the region.
- The project document assumes that natural regeneration is not possible due to the extent of degradation, and that artificial regeneration is the only solution. Two major issues arise from these assumptions: a) natural regeneration can often be restarted, even on highly degraded soils through the exclusion of fire and livestock; and b) expecting poor populations to work on restoration in highly degraded areas is unrealistic due to the lack of an economic potential that farmers could find acceptable.
- The Worobong South Forest Reserve is a gazetted production forest area, and as such, it is subject to a management plan with the purpose of ensuring the Reserve’s sustainability. The links between the overall management of the Reserve and the activities being conducted under the project have not been addressed by the proposal.

3.1.2 Structure and presentation of proposal

The project proposal includes in general terms elements under the various headings and subheadings required by the ITTO project formulation manual.

An introductory unit is composed of parts A and B, in which the initial part A gives information on the project’s relevance to ITTO and its compliance with ITTO objectives and criteria, and the project’s relationship to ITTO’s Action Plan. In part B, the document first gives information on its relevance to national policies, regarding both forestry sector policies in general, more specific policies regarding social forestry, and Ghana’s recently established reforestation program. Subsequently, there is a discussion on the project’s institutional and legal framework focusing exclusively on the DWM.⁵

The fact that the institutional and legal framework in the project document is focused strictly on the proposed management organization brings up an important structural issue. It would have helped if the section had emphasized the rights, obligations, roles and responsibilities of all major stakeholders, including the FD, the different communities, decentralized local authorities, and other stakeholders. The document could also have indicated the major legal texts regulating such rights and obligations.

The introductory unit is followed by “Part II”, which constitutes the body of the proposal, and includes several relevant elements, such as: project origin, objectives, justification (including problem analysis, tenure issues, and strategy among others), outputs, activities and inputs, and execution arrangements.

In this section, several issues arise from a structural standpoint. First, while the development objective provides an adequate general orientation, the two specific objectives (as stated on p. 10 of the project documents) are way too broad and should focus on the project area, and carry a quantitative dimension. Second, the specific objective No. 2 is formulated differently in different parts of the proposal.⁶ Third, the objectives are stated before the problem to be addressed, when in fact they

⁵ The 31st December Women’s Movement is a nation-wide non-governmental organization with a record of active collaboration with the Forestry Department. The DWM claims a membership of over 2.0 million members throughout the country and shows a track record of successful management of projects including the establishment of woodlots for the production of fuelwood and fodder. It has also organized seminars, workshops, and symposia on tree planting, maintenance of biodiversity, and sustainable management of non-timber forest products.

⁶ While on p. 10 Specific Objective 2 is stated as: “To support the implementation of community plantation programmes in degraded areas”, on p. 25 it is presented as: “To establish 1,200 ha of community plantation in a degraded forest area.

should guide the process of solving the problem. Additionally, the problem is stated with a nationwide scope, which is extremely broad. The project approach would be significantly improved if the problem discussion were concentrated on the project area.

Regarding land tenure, although this is a gazetted Forest Reserve (on which the Forestry Commission has statutory prerogatives), it is clearly stated that the area belongs to the “stools” (traditional authorities), who hold it in trust for the people. It is also stated that according to the new forest policy, planted trees will become the property of the planter. While these very general statements are encouraging, there is nothing clear as to the rights and obligations of each of the major stakeholders (communities, stools, Forestry Commission, DWM). Additionally, the fact that 72% of the population belong to the Krobo ethnic group and therefore, are outsiders, makes the tenure matter even more ambiguous.

In the long discussion dedicated to project strategy, more specifically under the “Economic Aspects” heading, the document mentions a “sustainability fund” or “Forest Plantation Fund” into which 2/3 of the proceeds from the plantations would be deposited to support continuing plantation efforts. While this is a commendable purpose, there is no quantitative analysis to support it. In a more general sense, the strategic part of the proposal is weak, lacking the support of rigorous and detailed analytical work necessary to select the best strategic option among alternative solutions to the problem addressed. This is particularly important regarding economic and social aspects: the proposal does not present any analysis of future economic benefits and costs expected from investments driven by the project.

Under managerial aspects, the strategy is also weak: even though it mentions the establishment of a Project Directorate and the constitution of a Project Steering Committee (PSC), with representations of seven organizations (or groups thereof),⁷ there is no information on either roles and responsibilities of each representation, or on linkages between them.

Regarding the management of the plantations after project completion the document states that the main responsibility for maintenance would rest with DWM, and not with the communities themselves, which would be the normal approach. Additionally, it would seem that too little attention has been given to the long term development of the plantations and their maintenance, even if the establishment of a Forest Plantation Fund has been mentioned.

The proposal also briefly discusses two major sources of risk associated with the project: i) the continuing support of the Government for private and community reforestation initiatives; and ii) the threat of bushfires. Regarding the first of these items it would make more sense to state it as “lack of continuing support”, which raises the serious issue of the extent to which the Government is committed to its own policies and programs. As for the second item, fire is a common problem, and the project seems to have made major efforts to address it, while significant progress can still be made.

The project also describes expected outputs under specific objectives as follows:

Under Specific Objective 1:

- **Output 1.1:** Management and administrative structure of DWM and district environmental management unit in the project area strengthened.
- **Output 1.1:** Technical capabilities of DWM in forest management in the district strengthened.

Under Specific Objective 2:

- **Output 2.1:** 800 ha of teak plantations in pure stands established for industrial supply.

⁷ DWM, the Forestry Department, the Ministry of Lands and Forests, the Ministry of Agriculture, the District Authorities of the Project Area, the ITTO Secretariat, and the donor agencies.

- **Output 2.2:** 400 ha of agro-forestry plantation with food crops of farmers' choice and with *Senna siamea* and *Triplochiton scleroxylon* established.

The remaining sections of "Part II" deal with operational planning procedures including activities and inputs as related to the four project outputs under the two specific objectives. Additionally, following the design structure for ITTO projects, the document includes the logical framework in Annex 1 and the workplan in Annex 2. All these procedures are presented with appropriate logic and content, although the timing of some activities seems overly ambitious.⁸ A possible improvement in the workplan would be a sequencing of the activities and the specification of the linkages among them. While some activities can be carried out in parallel or independently from others, many will not be able to start before others are completed.

The monitoring and evaluation aspects of project design constitute another structural weakness of this proposal: they are totally absent.⁹ A project proposal should contain a concrete plan of operational and financial reporting, indicating the addressees and their responsibilities, and a program of control meetings indicating attendees and their roles. Additionally, for the reports as well as for the meetings, the plan should indicate the purpose, content and timing.

Part IV closes the project document with a complete and detailed budget, effectively presented both by standard budget line items over time and by activity in each expenditure category.

While on the whole the proposal generally satisfies ITTO requirements, one of its shortcomings is the lack of a post-project perspective, above and beyond the intended situation after project completion. In this sense, two major options are possible: a) the project constitutes a first stage in a longer process needed to resolve the problems addressed; and b) externally supported activities end with the project. In the first case, the proposal should contain an overview of what a follow-up phase could be. In the second case, it should consider an "exit strategy" through which project activities are transferred to beneficiaries so that they can ensure the continuity of the structures and functions created by the project as factors of development and better well-being.

3.2. Project execution

3.2.1. Efficiency and effectiveness

In this section, efficiency and effectiveness are evaluated under their conventional aspects, i.e., with respect to attainment of goals and outcomes; not in terms of the development objective.

The execution of project activities, under the responsibility of DWM as executing agency, is documented in the progress reports, which normally cover periods of six months. The reports are fairly detailed and point out both successes and shortcomings in project implementation.

On the whole, the project appears to have been efficiently and effectively managed by DWM. This is reflected in numerous field accomplishments; several successful capacity building efforts; strong working relationships between DWM, the Forestry Commission, the beneficiary population and other stakeholders; and the strong enthusiasm of the beneficiary populations after project completion.

The project seems to have been effective and efficient in implementing activities related to capacity building in nine specific areas relevant to project activities.¹⁰ Among these activities, nursery establishment and management have seen a high degree of involvement on the part of women.

⁸ The project was designed with all planting activities (on 1,200 ha) to be carried out in three years. .

⁹ In fact, the project document goes from "Part II" to "Part IV", skipping "Part III", which normally contains the monitoring and evaluation elements under the normal ITTO proposal structure.

¹⁰ These areas were: rural diagnosis methods, gender sensitization, managerial skills, nursery management, plantation establishment and management, fire prevention and control, cassava processing, snail farming, and forestry legislation and policies.

Additionally, the project has been effective in fire prevention activities with technical training of volunteer fire combat squads and the education of the communities in fire prevention.

However, there were more difficulties in implementing the plantation targets, even though several forest plantation efforts have been technically successful. It is noted in progress report No. 6 (March through June 2002) that because the number of settlements bordering the demarcated area is only five, there is a constraint on labor available for planting. Therefore, more bordering communities were included in early 2003 to increase the number of persons available for planting activities. Additionally, in early 2004 the overall planting target was reduced from the original 1,200 ha to 700 ha, in combination with livelihood schemes that had not been originally contemplated. These changes reflect good management in the sense that if a design problem is detected, a partial redesign is much better than pursuing activities that are bound to fail.

Regarding livelihood schemes, these concentrated on cassava processing and snail farming. This change required a budget revision involving the reduction of planting, agroforestry and related activities to accommodate these new operations. These changes were implemented through a participatory effort involving the communities, the executing agency, the FC, and the ITTO.

These examples reflect that from an efficiency standpoint the project appears to have been successful, as shown by the livelihood schemes that were still in operation at the time of the ex-post evaluation, fire brigades still performing, and several timber plantations showing considerable promise, despite some evident failures.

3.2.2. Techniques applied

In contrast to the Abutia Plains Project [PD 48/98 Rev. 1 (F)], which insisted on teak plantations, this project has included a much broader variety of species, of which *Cedrela*, *Ceiba*, *Terminalia* and *Senna* have been the most successful.¹¹ *Cedrela*, *Ceiba*, and *Terminalia* are doing well to exceptionally well in timber plantations, while *Senna* is showing very good performance for wood-based fuels, even when planted on poor soils, and is also a means of stimulating natural succession.

In contrast, *Khaya* stands are generally surviving, but they consistently suffer from attacks by the shoot borer *Hypsipyla* and do not seem to have any future. *Tectona* (teak) has failed everywhere, apparently due to a combination of poor soil selection and frequent bushfires.

A major factor adversely affecting the project's teak plantations has been the choice of soils. Teak can be a very robust species as long as it is planted on appropriate sites. The literature on teak plantations is consistent regarding soils of at least moderate fertility, depth of 1 meter or even more, on flat ground or slight slopes, and well drained. Soils that are shallow or compact are not suitable, and under such conditions, alternative species must be considered. Based on the field visits, many of the soils where teak was planted were shallow and of very poor fertility.

Weeding is an essential consideration in early forest plantation management. For most of the species used in the project, plantations are susceptible to weeds, particularly as a fire hazard and also from a competition standpoint. In consequence, frequent weeding is recommended in the literature (often more than once a year) until the third and sometimes the fourth year. Based on the plantations inspected, such weeding operations were the exception rather than the rule.

An additional consideration is that the project originally attempted to plant 1,200 ha in less than 3 years. Even with the plantation target reduction to 700 ha and the project period extensions, this is poor planning. Apart from the fact that all plantations would be attaining rotation at roughly the same time, without being able to provide a steady product yield, this scheduling gives hardly any time to

¹¹ The species included in the project have been *Antiaris africana*, *Ceiba pentandra*, *Entandophragma angolense*, *Entandophragma cylindricum*, *Khaya anthoteca*, *Khaya ivorensis*, *Mansonina altissima*, *Mimusops heckelii*, *Terminalia ivorensis*, *Terminalia superba*, and *Triplochiton scleroxylon* among the indigenous, and *Cedrela odorata*, *Senna siamea*, and *Tectona grandis* among the exotics.

learn from experience or recover from errors and, of course, imposes high maintenance costs. However, a positive effect of the target plantation area reductions is that it may have been a factor in the evident success of some of the plantations.

From a social standpoint, although late in the project period livelihood activities were started, the project has not succeeded in providing sustainable income, neither for women nor for communities. Livelihood activities like cassava processing and snail farming are a bare minimum. Additionally, even though the project conducted extensive training in at least nine subject areas, detailed documentation was provided for only one training workshop.

Finally, the agroforestry approaches applied need improvement. For example, in the case of *Cedrela* plantations, this species has been established in combination with plantains. A problem with this association, at least in the areas visited, is that *Cedrela* occupies the site very early and plantain trees become unproductive by the third year. Resulting from this outcome, some farmers are unfavorable to the planting of *Cedrela*. Precisely because of its successful performance, it is making the plantains unproductive. Possible solutions to this issue would be either wider spacings than the standard 3m x 3m (as has been tried in Togo), or making more land available to farmers so that they can continue to produce livelihood crops under the timber trees.

3.2.3. Project management, financial management, administration

The project seems to have been managed effectively without any serious problems, and project execution has been characterized by a good collaboration between the executing agency and the Forestry Commission. The Project Implementation Committee (PIC), which was established in the initial stages of the project to guide the project's execution, normally met on a bi-monthly basis and visited the project site at these occasions. The project progress reports have been issued consistently by the PIC with proper detail and sent to ITTO HQ as required. Additionally, the PSC has held annual meetings at which representatives from ITTO HQ have participated. Finally, at the beneficiary level, five Community Forestry Committees (CFC) and One Local Implementation Committee were established.

As to financial management it would seem that certain expenditures e.g., for project personnel, exceeded the amounts approved, namely for the posts of Project Manager, Nursery Manager and Plantation Manager. These overruns were compensated by savings made from other posts like Field Assistant, Socio-economist and Journalist.

Another financial management item is noted in progress report no 7: the remaining amount of the second tranche of ITTO funds was received in January 2003 although a formal request was made in July 2002. This delay was attributed to the failure of other ITTO funded projects under the Forestry Commission to meet certain requirements demanded by the ITTO secretariat. Despite this funding delay, the project was able to continue operating, which reflects good management skills.

3.2.4. External factors – unexpected problems or circumstances

An important issue that could affect the future of project activities is the fact that logging is still being carried out in a small area of old growth natural stands, covering around 20% of the Worobong South Forest Reserve.¹² More importantly, since the Reserve's management plan is no longer in effect, the logging operations are not under the control of a long-term planning system for the Reserve as a whole.

The evaluation team was informed that all logging in the Reserve is monitored and carried out with a reduced impact system. The fact that logging is occurring, no matter how reduced the impact, in the absence of a management plan raises major management issues, such as the protection of biodiversity

¹² Based on information obtained by the evaluation team from local farmers, logging was being conducted on the project site even two years ago.

in the remaining old growth and the future balance of the Reserve’s timber production. Additionally, farmers are required to protect and restore the forest with limited compensation and uncertain returns on their investments, even though concession holders are earning income while perhaps creating damage in the same Reserve. In preparing the new management plan, the decision on whether or not to harvest timber in the remaining old growth stands must be carefully examined with special consideration of biodiversity conservation and other environmental effects.

Another important unexpected problem deals with large land permits being granted by the FC to traditional local landlord or chieftains (“admitted farmers”) under the category of “cultural reserve” (around 40% of the Reserve) in the overall Reserve’s zoning. This area appears to be large scale farming including outsiders accepted by landlords. This issue is controversial, especially since while some FC staff present it as a reality, others dismiss it as illegal land takeovers without FC authorization. However, unless such issues are totally resolved, a major opportunity for the restoration of the Reserve may be lost to land use conflicts.

A third unanticipated problem has to do with the sharing of plantation benefits. While farmers are expecting a share of the proceeds from their plantation efforts, the sharing by the different parties is surrounded by major uncertainty. The evaluation team was informed that the distribution of benefits from community forest plantations on public lands was planned on the basis of the following scheme considered for establishment through legislation: 40 % for the State; 40 % for the communities; 15 % for the traditional land owners; and 5 % for the supporting structure (normally an NGO). While this may be a point of departure in an attempt to determine fair shares for the parties involved, its generalized application through legislation appears too rigid, and a regulatory or even a contractual approach may be more effective. In addition, several farmers at Worobong expressed concern regarding the uncertainty of their expected shares.

3.3. Evaluation of project results

3.3.1. Anticipated results

Concerning anticipated results, as previously mentioned, under Specific Objective 2, Output 2.1 was changed from “800 ha of teak plantations in pure stands...” to “200 ha of teak plantations and 100 ha of *Cedrela odorata*...”. Accordingly, the total area to be reforested was reduced from 1,200 ha to 700 ha.

Expected and achieved results are summarized in Table 1, including the opinion of the evaluators. These are presented in the same order as in the Project Document. It is worth mentioning that the opinion of the evaluation team is not necessarily in agreement with what is indicated on this matter in the Project Completion Report.

Table 1. Expected and achieved results according to ex-post evaluation mission

| Anticipated results | Accomplished results according to ex post evaluation |
|--|--|
| 1.1 Management and administrative structure of DWM and district environmental management unit in the project area strengthened | Largely achieved through the establishment and operation of a local implementation committee and five community forest committees, as well as through training in sensitization, rural diagnostics and managerial skills. |
| 1.2 Technical capabilities of DWM in forest management in the district strengthened | Largely achieved through training in nursery establishment and management, plantation establishment and management, and fire prevention and suppression. |
| 2.1 200 ha of teak plantations in pure stands and 100 ha of <i>Cedrela odorata</i> established | Partially achieved. While the total area actually planted exceeds the anticipated output for both teak (210 ha) and <i>Cedrela</i> (110 ha), all the teak plantations observed have failed. On the contrary, several of the <i>Cedrela</i> plantations visited are showing very good performance. However, there was no way to confirm the total area planted. |

2.2 400 ha of agro-forestry plantation with food crops of farmers choice and with *Senna siamea* and *Triplochiton scleroxylon* established Partially achieved. Only 350 ha have been planted, and with a number of species other than those originally planned. Many stands exhibit good performance except for *Khaya* that will probably not succeed. There was no way to confirm the total area planted.

3.3.2. Unanticipated or unexpected results

A major unanticipated result has been the success of the livelihood schemes based on cassava production and snail farming. These activities, which were not anticipated in the original project proposal, were still in operation at the time of the evaluation, with the possibility of expansion. Considering that livelihood activities had not been given enough consideration in the original proposal, their implementation was a good project management decision. However, considering that ITTO funding should support sustainable timber production and forest conservation, there is some question as to whether these activities should be supported by ITTO projects. Also, successful cassava planting may end up reducing the interest in forest plantations and competing with it. Other forestry-related livelihood schemes, such as sequential planting would have a better fit.

3.3.3. Evaluation in terms of ecological and economic sustainability

There was a lack of quantified technical baseline information regarding the project area (i.e., area of different vegetation types, area under agriculture, soil maps). This would require at least aerial photos or satellite images. During the visit, maps of the distribution of the plantation, including planting dates, were not available. Additionally, in the planning phase no soil surveys seem to have been undertaken, despite the fact that the land, as mentioned in the project document, was degraded.

Sequential planting, i.e., several plantation systems, with yields at different points in time to ensure continuous income, were not considered by the project proposal. This is essential to ensure the livelihood of participating communities. An additional advantage of sequential planting is that part of the revenues it provides can be used to support the cost timber plantation maintenance, which is essential and must be ensured by project design. However, not all sequential planting schemes will succeed; for example, *Taungya*, a form of sequential planting, was tried especially with teak, with poor results.

From an economic point of view, a cost-benefit analysis of the investment venture proposed by the project should have been conducted as part of the design. If so done, it would have become evident that the poor “beneficiary” communities would not have been able to practice plantation maintenance over the period of time required by these operations. Additionally this type of analysis might have revealed that plantations of teak or *Khaya* would not have been financially feasible.

The social and economic information that would have signaled the local people’s capability to carry out the project was not available at project design, and also, there is some question on the extent to which the indigenous populations were involved in the design process, and if their views on the species selection were sought. It is essential that the intended beneficiaries be actively involved already at the stage of project design and their interests taken into account.

In the end, however, given the high degree of success of certain timber species there is hope for both economic and financial sustainability, if and when a follow-on phase emphasizes the right site-species fit, sequential planting, serious bushfire control, and a high degree of participation of the local people in the design.

3.3.4. General achievements and expected future results

The Project Completion Report provides a long presentation on the achievement of the specific objectives. First, under Specific Objective 1, Output 1.1, the report refers to the creation of five Community Forest Committees with representations of project area communities, and one Local Implementation Committee for communities to interact with project management. Additionally, the

report mentions a gender sensitization workshop, and a training event in multiple managerial skills, with 60 participants in each event. Finally, a socio-economic survey was conducted, which, among other things, led to the implementation of the livelihood schemes discussed above. As a result of all these actions, Output 1.1, i.e., “Management and administrative structure of DWM and district environmental management unit in the project area strengthened”, has been largely achieved.

Second, regarding Output 1.2, several training activities are mentioned, dealing with nursery establishment and management (attended by 150 women and 60 men), plantation establishment and management (attended by 200 men and 150 women), and fire management (164 fire volunteers trained). Resulting from these efforts, Output 1.2, i.e., “Technical capabilities of DWM in forest management in the district strengthened” has been largely accomplished.

Under Specific Objective 2, Output 2.1, i.e., “200 ha of teak plantations in pure stands and 100 ha of *Cedrela odorata* established” has been accomplished through the plantation of 210 ha of teak and 110 ha of *Cedrela*. However this achievement is considered partial due to the totally unsatisfactory condition of the teak plantations visited, even though many *Cedrela* plantations are evidencing very good performance.

Finally, Output 2.2, “400 ha of agro-forestry plantation with food crops of farmers choice and with *Senna siamea* and *Triplochiton scleroxylon* established” is also considered as a partial accomplishment, since only 350 ha out of the 400 anticipated have been planted, and certain species like *Khaya* are performing way below expectations due to insect attacks. An interesting observation with respect to this output is that several species other than *Senna* and *Triplochiton* were used successfully.

On the whole, the project in general and the forestry and agroforestry efforts in the field have been reasonably successful, even though there is plenty of room for improvement in plantation maintenance, fire control, livelihood schemes and managerial capabilities.

3.3.5. Beneficiaries and evaluation of project and non-project effects on communities

The evaluation team found that the beneficiary population continues to be exceptionally enthusiastic and continues pursuing activities initiated by the project. Women’s participation in the project seems to have been significantly more direct and effective than in other projects reviewed, although a great number of the project activities appear to have been carried out by men. During the field visits, the team was mostly joined by men and the fire brigade consisted only of men.

At the meeting with the communities, however a number of women expressed their views as to the merits of the project. It would seem that the gender sensitization workshops contributed to creating awareness among the project beneficiaries on the necessity for women to participate in project activities and decision making related to natural resource management.

As an important observation regarding community forestry projects in general, it is risky and not advisable to propose plantations to restore highly degraded areas. The results will almost invariably be below the economic potential acceptable to farmers, and the teak plantations in Worobong are a concrete example of this observation. As a general principle, it is better to focus on plantations that can perform effectively in terms of timber production leading to net benefits for the populations, and have them assist in modest restoration efforts based on natural regeneration supported by fire control and usage restrictions.

As mentioned earlier, the distribution of benefits for farmers and other participants in plantation investments on public lands is planned on the basis of a standard scheme considered for establishment through legislation. The evaluation team is of the view that the proposed scheme is very rigid and could be counterproductive if established through legislation, since it may not be acceptable to communities. A better approach would be through contractual arrangements between legally registered community associations and government authorities.

3.3.6. Technical and scientific quality of results and their dissemination

The good results attained so far, through the *Cedrela*, *Terminalia*, *Ceiba*, and *Senna* plantations should be disseminated to a wider audience, and the prospects for the future use of these species, both on the domestic and international markets should be examined further. The project has also produced a few very simple printed technical materials for dissemination. One of these is a manual issued in a collaborative effort between the Forestry Commission, ITTO and the DWN with the title: *Sustainable Agro Forestry and Forestry Extension Manual for Communities*. Should there be a follow-on phase, a stronger emphasis on dissemination of results would be most appropriate.

3.3.7. Present community and authority participation in project activities

The beneficiary population continues to be exceptionally favorable to the project. This was very clearly expressed at a plenary meeting held with some 300 members of the communities. There has also been a significant and effective collaboration between the implementing NGO (DWM) and the Forestry Commission and the good relations seem to prevail after project completion. Additionally, it is apparent that the farmers continue some of the agro-forestry activities in the Reserve, although it is difficult to estimate to what extent there are any plantation maintenance activities. In the team's view maintenance of plantations in the post project period is essential, and activities capable of providing revenue to support plantation maintenance costs (like the previously discussed "sequential planting") should be considered.

3.3.8. Post project situation

The difference between pre and post project situation is that currently there are plantations in place and that high expectations were raised among villagers. While most teak plantations seem to be in a hopeless condition, many of the other species are performing very well and show considerable promise. As discussed in previous sections, some adjustments will be necessary regarding plantation maintenance, agroforestry systems, fire control, and livelihood measures.

Clearly, the post project situation presents some problems as well as interesting opportunities that would warrant the consideration of a follow-on phase.

4. Relationship to ITTO/ITTA goals and objectives

The project being evaluated has a high degree of compatibility with Ghana's forestry sector policies. The objectives are in consonance with the nation's forest policy which aims at i) managing forest production for industry and exports according to sustained yield; ii) promoting conservation and tree planting on farms; and iii) strengthening the sector's institutions. In addition, the project supports the public's as well as NGOs' participation in forest management and conservation as well as the involvement of local people in direct forestry activity, including resource development, protection, and utilization, both privately and in collaboration with State institutions.

As to the project's compliance with ITTO Objectives it makes specific reference to the objectives (c), (d), (j), and (k) established under Article 1 of the International Tropical Timber Agreement, 1994.

In terms of ITTO goals and objectives, the project falls within the functions of the Committee on Reforestation and Forest Management in its three areas of responsibility, i.e., reforestation, forest rehabilitation, and forest management.

The project is related to the following ITTO objectives under Article 1 of the 1994 Agreement:

- Objective c): To contribute to the process of sustainable development;

- Objective d): To enhance the capacity of members to implement a strategy for achieving exports of tropical timber and timber products from sustainably managed sources;
- Objective j): To encourage members to support and develop industrial tropical timber reforestation and forest management activities as well as rehabilitation of degraded forest land, with due regard for the interests of local communities dependent on forest resources;
- Objective k): To improve marketing and distribution of tropical timber exports from sustainably managed sources.

The project is also consistent with the following ITTO Criteria:

- Production of industrial tropical timber;
- Yielding benefits to the tropical timber economy as a whole and relevance to producing as well as consuming members;
- Reasonable prospects for positive economic returns in relation to costs based on the concept of the involvement of women in community reforestation and forest management.

The project also supports the ITTO Action Plan and is related to the priorities established by the Committee on Reforestation and Forest Management, in particular to the following strategies:

- Strategy c): Instill a sense of urgency amongst consumers and producer nations to maintain tropical timber supply through sustainable forest management;
- Strategy d): Demonstrate the economic viability and promote long term investment in sustainable forest management;
- Strategy i): Encourage the development of sustainable timber production from tree plantations to rehabilitate and manage non-forest and degraded lands and to reduce the dependency on natural forests for timber supply;
- Strategy k): Facilitate the establishment of demonstration areas that reflect different models of management to enhance the transfer of technology and scientific knowledge;
- Strategy l) Encourage the full participation of local institutions in the development and implementation of projects.

Part III: Conclusions and recommendations

1. Lessons learned

1. Communities are not the problem in community-based forest management projects. In this as in other projects, the communities are eager to participate and keep their enthusiasm even when participation implies sacrifices and/or when the project fails to produce the projected incomes.
2. Maintenance of plantations in the post project period is essential, and the funds necessary to cover the costs must be available. One possibility is through sequential production systems that could provide continuing revenue, both for farmers' supplementary income and for the funding of these operations. Another may be the effective establishment of a forest fund.
3. In community forestry projects it is risky and not advisable to propose plantations to restore highly degraded areas. The results will almost invariably be below the economic potential acceptable to farmers. This is an unfair burden for the beneficiaries. Teak plantations in Worobong are a concrete example. The project has been successful in improving degraded sites through protection and natural regeneration, as opposed to plantations, which impose an unnecessary burden on the populations

4. When a project is aiming at the initiation of a long term for-profit venture, such as forest management or forest plantations, it is essential to carry out a serious cost-benefit analysis of the investment as part of its feasibility study during the project design stage. This analysis is absent in the case of the reviewed operation.
5. This project, once again confirms that site-species compatibility is fundamental for quality plantations, among other high quality technical inputs. This is evidenced by the failure of teak and the promising success of *Cedrela*, *Ceiba*, *Terminalia* and *Senna*.
6. The selection of an NGO as executing agency is a delicate matter and must follow a rigorous process. Additionally, NGOs participating in ITTO projects must be able to demonstrate the necessary technical capabilities in forestry-related matters. This project shows that NGOs, when properly selected can perform effectively in project management, and coordinate well with government agencies, leading to quality results.
7. Issues regarding the distribution of benefits must be settled during project preparation or in the earliest phase of project execution.
8. Normally, ITTO funding should be related to timber (production) and forest conservation: in the case of the reviewed operation, the production of cassava does not really fit in, while sequential production under agro-forestry systems would.
9. If a problem is detected with the design of the project, a mid-course correction or redesign is much better than pursuing activities that are bound to fail.

2. Conclusions

1. The project has not succeeded in achieving its development objective of providing sustainable income for women in the communities; activities like cassava processing and snail growing, established late in the project period are a bare minimum, although they continue in operation and seem to be working well.
2. However, considering the good condition of a significant portion of the plantation forest and the high level of participation of the local population, this is a project that still offers good possibilities of success if urgent measures are taken for follow up.
3. The project design revealed many important deficiencies of form and substance that had a negative impact on the project execution and the achievement of objectives.
4. Even after reducing significantly the plantation target area, there has been a highly accelerated plantation program. In the end, unless the plantation area is expanded significantly over the coming years, there will be a forest with an unbalanced age class structure. Additionally, with such short periods, there is no time to recover from mistakes or make adjustments, as shown by large areas of unsuccessful teak plantations.
5. Teak plantations have failed by and large. In contrast, *Cedrela*, *Terminalia*, *Ceiba* and *Senna* are showing performance ranging between good and very good, even with poor or no maintenance. There has been a fortunate selection of species based on trying a broad range of them.
6. The area planted is smaller than originally proposed, resulting in smaller but better plantations.
7. Women's participation in this project is obviously more direct and effective than in other projects, but most field activities were carried out by men.

8. There is no up-to-date management plan encompassing the plantation effort. This is an important weakness in a major Forest Reserve and affects the reviewed operation in the sense that it has been established without the guidance of a long-term perspective for the Reserve as a whole.
9. Logging is still being conducted in the remaining old growth forest part of the Reserve. Reduced impact logging is claimed, but the evaluation team could not tell one way or another. Also it seems that logging activities do not respond to the Reserve's management plan which has been outdated for years.
10. Large tracts in the reserve are being cultivated by landlords or private entrepreneurs without being subject to any forestry or environmental guideline.
11. Distribution of expected benefits is planned on the basis of a standard scheme considered for establishment through legislation. This is a very rigid scheme and may not be acceptable to communities. A better approach than imposing the scheme by legislation would be through contractual arrangements between legally registered community associations and government authorities for the management of forest reserves.
12. A reforestation effort with 1,200 ha originally planned was flawed from the project design stage; this was opportunely modified with a redesign and a much less ambitious plantation program (700 ha) combined with livelihood activities (e.g., cassava processing and snail production).
13. The beneficiary population continues to be highly favorable to the project.
14. There has been a significant and effective collaboration between the implementing NGO (DWM) and the Forestry Commission at the local, regional and national levels.
15. The project has produced a few simple printed technical materials for dissemination. Given the wealth of lessons of experience from this project, should there be a follow-on phase, dissemination of results will need a much stronger emphasis.

3. Recommendations

1. Recommendations concerning a follow-up phase

- 1.1. Support a follow-on phase with ITTO funding if requested. This should be a consolidation phase to solve issues that are pending and take advantage of opportunities offered by successful plantations.
- 1.2. Prepare a complete action-oriented management plan for the Worobong South Forest Reserve and discontinue logging in the remaining natural forests.
- 1.3. Take stock of the forest plantation experience in Worobong and surrounding areas to identify factors of success and failure as part of the eventual follow-on phase.

2. Recommendations for the implementing organization

- 2.1. If a follow-on phase is intended to be ITTO-funded, make efforts to obtain funds from other sources for agricultural inputs.
- 2.2. On the benefit sharing standards currently under study, avoid legislation on a rigid scheme and leave room for fair compensation under contractual arrangements.

3. Recommendations for ITTO

- 3.1 ITTO must avoid internal contradictions in projects with commercial logging concessions not following a management plan, taking place in the same Reserve where local people are putting in major efforts to restore the forest.
- 3.2 Given that the project's implementation took considerably more time than originally planned, for technically and organizationally complex operations such as this one, it is suggested that ITTO consider, longer implementation periods, i.e., of 5 or more years.
- 3.3 If a follow-on phase is requested, it is recommended that ITTO proceed with a prompt approval in order to take advantage of the successes to date and the good disposition of the beneficiaries.

Attachments

Attachment 1. Schedule of the Worobong evaluation mission

Monday 7 August 2006

- 09:00 Meeting with Ms. Edith Abruquah (Forestry Commission Regional Manager for East Region), Ms Rejoice Ahiable (DWM representative) and other Forestry Commission staff)
- 11:00 Meeting with the Chief of the new Forest Plantations Division
- 14:00 Afternoon dedicated to team meetings and review of documents

Tuesday 8 August 2006

- 08:00 Mission travels to Koforidua, Begoro and Worobong (team stays overnight at Koforidua)
- 10:00 Brief visit at Begoro Forestry Commission office
- 11:00 Brief visit to cassava processing operation at Akoradarko village
- 12:00 Plenary community meeting at Worobong South Forest Reserve
- 15:00 Brief visit to a private teak plantation

Wednesday 9 August 2006

- 09:00 Discussion with District Forest Manager and other Forestry Commission staff at Begoro
- 10:00 Visit to Akoradarko village on market day
- 11:00 Field visits on various project plantation operations

Thursday 10 August 2006

- 09:00 Continue visit to project plantation operations
- 12:00 Visit to major private plantation (*Khaya*)
- 15:00 Return to Accra

Friday 11 August 2006

- 09:00 Debriefing session at Forestry Commission headquarters (covering both Abutia and Worobong projects)
- 14:00 Visit to DWM headquarters

Saturday 12 August 2006

- 09:00 Day dedicated to additional consultations and report writing

Sunday 13 August 2006

- 08:30 Mission travels overland to Lomé, Togo

* * *